

ON DISCRETIZATION OF C*-ALGEBRAS

CHRIS HEUNEN AND MANUEL L. REYES

ABSTRACT. The C*-algebra of bounded operators on the separable infinite-dimensional Hilbert space cannot be mapped to an AW*-algebra in such a way that each unital commutative C*-subalgebra $C(X)$ factors normally through $\ell^\infty(X)$. Consequently, there is no faithful functor discretizing C*-algebras to AW*-algebras, including von Neumann algebras, in this way.

1. INTRODUCTION

In operator algebra it is common practice to think of a C*-algebra as representing a noncommutative analogue of a topological space, and to think of a W*-algebra as representing a noncommutative analogue of a measurable space. What would it mean to make precise the notion of a C*-algebra A as a ‘noncommutative ring of continuous functions’? The present article explores the idea that one should first embed A in an appropriate noncommutative algebra of ‘bounded functions on the underlying quantum set of the spectrum of A ’, just like any topological space embeds in a discrete one [1, 4]. It is tempting to demand that such a ‘noncommutative function ring’ be an atomic W*-algebra, but we work more generally under the mere assumption that they be AW*-algebras.

Write **Cstar** for the category of unital C*-algebras with unital *-homomorphisms, and **AWstar** for the category of AW*-algebras with unital *-homomorphisms whose restriction to the projection lattices preserve arbitrary least upper bounds.¹ The discussion above leads naturally to the following notion, in keeping with the programme of taking commutative subalgebras seriously [7, 14, 3, 15, 2], that has recently been successful [8, 5, 9, 6].

Definition. A *discretization* of a unital C*-algebra A is a unital *-homomorphism $\phi: A \rightarrow M$ to an AW*-algebra M whose restriction to each commutative unital C*-subalgebra $C \cong C(X)$ factors through the natural inclusion $C(X) \rightarrow \ell^\infty(X)$ via a morphism $\ell^\infty(X) \dashrightarrow M$ in **AWstar**, so that the following diagram commutes.

$$\begin{array}{ccc} A & \xrightarrow{\phi} & M \\ \uparrow & & \uparrow \\ C(X) & \hookrightarrow & \ell^\infty(X) \end{array}$$

This short note proves that this construction degenerates in prototypical cases.

Date: March 25, 2015.

2010 Mathematics Subject Classification. 46L30, 46L85, 46M15.

Key words and phrases. noncommutative topology, discrete space, pure state.

C. Heunen was supported by EPSRC Fellowship EP/L002388/1.

M. L. Reyes was supported by NSF grant DMS-1407152.

¹See [9, Lemma 2.2] for further characterizations of these morphisms.

Theorem. *If $\phi: B(H) \rightarrow M$ is a discretization for a separable infinite-dimensional Hilbert space H , then $M = 0$.*

For W^* -algebras M , this obstruction concretely means that $B(H)$ has no non-trivial representation on a Hilbert space such that every (maximal) commutative $*$ -subalgebra has a basis of simultaneous eigenvectors.

Consequently, discretization cannot be made into a faithful functor.

Corollary. *Let a functor $F: \mathbf{Cstar} \rightarrow \mathbf{AWstar}$ have natural unital $*$ -homomorphisms $\eta_A: A \rightarrow F(A)$. Suppose there are isomorphisms $F(C(X)) \cong \ell^\infty(X)$ for each compact Hausdorff space X that turn $\eta_{C(X)}$ into the inclusion $C(X) \rightarrow \ell^\infty(X)$. If a unital C^* -algebra A has a unital $*$ -homomorphism $\alpha: B(K) \rightarrow A$ for an infinite-dimensional Hilbert space K , then $F(A) = 0$.*

As the proof of the Theorem relies on the use of annihilating projections and on the Archimedean property of the partial ordering of positive elements in the discretizing AW^* -algebra M , it is intriguing to note that this does not rule out faithful functors F as above from \mathbf{Cstar} to the category \mathbf{Cstar} or to the category of Baer $*$ -rings with $*$ -homomorphisms that restrict to complete orthomorphisms on projection lattices. A rather different approach to the problem of extending the embeddings $C(X) \hookrightarrow \ell^\infty(X)$ to noncommutative C^* -algebras has recently appeared in [10]. We also remark that since the identity functor discretizes all finite-dimensional C^* -algebras, this truly infinite-dimensional obstruction is independent of the Kochen–Specker theorem, a key ingredient in some previous spectral obstruction results [14, 3].

The rest of this note proves the Theorem and its Corollary.

2. PROOF

Notation. Fix a separable infinite-dimensional Hilbert space $H = L^2[0, 1]$, and consider its algebra $B(H)$ of bounded operators. Write D for the discrete maximal abelian $*$ -subalgebra generated as a W^* -algebra by the projections q_n onto the Fourier basis vectors $e_n = \exp(2\pi i n -)$ for $n \in \mathbb{Z}$. There is a canonical conditional expectation $E: B(H) \rightarrow D$ that sends $f \in B(H)$ to its diagonal part $\sum q_n f q_n$.

The main results rely upon the following mild strengthening of the recent solution of the Kadison–Singer problem [11].

Lemma 1. *Let A be any unital C^* -algebra, and $\psi_0: D \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$ a pure state of D . The map $\psi_0 \cdot 1_A: D \rightarrow A$ given by $f \mapsto \psi_0(f) \cdot 1_A$ extends uniquely to a unital completely positive map $\psi: B(H) \rightarrow A$ given by $f \mapsto \psi_0(E(f)) \cdot 1_A$.*

Proof. We employ a standard reduction of the unique extension problem to Anderson’s paving conjecture, as outlined, for instance, in [13].

The extension $\psi_0 \circ E$ is well known to be a pure state, proving existence. For uniqueness, let $\psi: B(H) \rightarrow A$ be any unital completely positive map extending $\psi_0 \cdot 1_A$. It suffices to show that $\psi = \psi_0 \circ E$, as then $E(f) \in D$ for $f \in B(H)$ implies $\psi(f) = \psi(E(f)) = \psi_0(E(f)) \cdot 1_A$ as desired. As f is a linear combination of two self-adjoint elements, we may further assume that $f = f^* \in B(H)$. Replacing f with $f - E(f)$, we reduce to showing $\psi(f) = 0$ when $f = f^*$ and $E(f) = 0$. To this end, let $\varepsilon > 0$. By Anderson’s paving conjecture, established in [11, 1.3], there exist projections $p_1, \dots, p_n \in D$ with $\sum p_i = 1$ and $\|p_i f p_i\| \leq \varepsilon \|f\|$ for all i . As

$\psi|_D = \psi_0$ is a pure state, up to reordering indices we have $\psi(p_1) = 1$ and $\psi(p_i) = 0$ for $i > 1$.

By the Schwarz inequality for 2-positive maps [12, Exercise 3.4], for all $i > 1$ we have $\|\psi(p_i f)\|^2 \leq \|\psi(p_i p_i^*)\| \cdot \|\psi(f^* f)\| = 0$ since $\psi(p_i p_i^*) = \psi(p_i) = 0$. Thus $\psi(p_i f) = 0$ for all $i > 1$, making $\psi(f) = \sum_{i=1}^n \psi(p_i f) = \psi(p_1 f)$. A symmetric argument replacing f with $p_1 f$ yields $\psi(f) = \psi(p_1 f) = \psi(p_1 f p_1)$. Unitality of ψ furthermore gives $\|\psi\| = 1$ [12, Corollary 2.8], so that

$$\|\psi(f)\| = \|\psi(p_1 f p_1)\| \leq \|p_1 f p_1\| \leq \varepsilon \|f\|.$$

As ε was arbitrary, we deduce that $\psi(f) = 0$ as desired. \square

Note that Lemma 1 still holds with ψ merely 2-positive. Next we consider the continuous maximal abelian *-subalgebra $C = L^\infty[0, 1]$ of $B(H)$.

Lemma 2. *Let $\psi: B(H) \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$ be the unique extension of a pure state of D . The restriction of ψ to C is the state given by integration (against the Lebesgue measure).*

Proof. Each $f \in C$ has diagonal part $E(f) = \int_0^1 f(x) dx$ because

$$\begin{aligned} \langle f e_n, e_n \rangle &= \langle f \cdot \exp(2\pi i n -), \exp(2\pi i n -) \rangle \\ &= \int_0^1 f(x) \cdot e^{2\pi i n x} \cdot \overline{e^{2\pi i n x}} dx \\ &= \int_0^1 f(x) dx. \end{aligned}$$

Because we assumed that ψ is a pure state of D , we have $\psi = \psi \circ E$ as in Lemma 1. Hence $\psi(f) = \psi(E(f)) = \psi(\int_0^1 f(x) dx) = \int_0^1 f(x) dx$. \square

To prove the Theorem, recall that for an orthogonal set of projections $\{p_i\}$ in an AW*-algebra, $\sum p_i$ denotes their least upper bound in the lattice of projections.

Proof of Theorem. Write $C \cong C(X)$ and $D \cong C(Y)$ for compact Hausdorff spaces X and Y . The discretization $\phi: B(H) \rightarrow M$ is accompanied by the following commutative diagram, where α and β are morphisms in **AWstar**.

$$\begin{array}{ccc} C = L^\infty[0, 1] \cong C(X) & \longrightarrow & \ell^\infty(X) \\ \downarrow & \searrow \phi & \downarrow \alpha \\ B(H) & \longrightarrow & M \\ \uparrow & \nearrow \hat{\beta} & \uparrow \beta \\ D = \ell^\infty(\mathbb{Z}) \cong C(Y) & \longrightarrow & \ell^\infty(Y) \end{array}$$

The atomic projections $\delta_x \in \ell^\infty(X)$ for $x \in X$ and $\delta_y \in \ell^\infty(Y)$ for $y \in Y$ have respective images $p_x = \alpha(\delta_x) \in M$ and $q_y = \beta(\delta_y) \in M$. For each y , the map $\psi: B(H) \rightarrow q_y M q_y$ given by $\psi(f) = q_y \phi(f) q_y$ is completely positive and unital (where q_y is the unit of $q_y M q_y$). Its restriction to D is of the following form, where we consider $f \in D$ as an element of the function algebra $C(Y) \subseteq \ell^\infty(Y)$:

$$\psi(f) = q_y \phi(f) q_y = \beta(\delta_y f \delta_y) = \beta(f(y) \delta_y) = f(y) q_y.$$

Thus there is a pure state ψ_0 on D with $\psi|_D = \psi_0 \cdot q_y$. It follows from Lemma 1 that $\psi = (\psi_0 \circ E) \cdot q_y$. For $t \in [0, 1]$, write $e_t = \phi(\chi_{[0, t]})$ for the image of the characteristic

function $\chi_{[0,t]} \in C$. Lemma 2 implies $\psi(\chi_{[0,t]}) = \left(\int_0^1 \chi_{[0,t]}(x) dx \right) \cdot q_y = tq_y$, so

$$q_y e_t q_y = q_y \phi(\chi_{[0,t]}) q_y = \psi(\chi_{[0,t]}) = tq_y$$

for all $y \in Y$ and all $t \in [0, 1]$.

Considering each projection $\chi_{[0,t]}$ as an element of $C(X)$, fix clopen sets $K_t \subseteq X$ such that $\chi_{[0,t]} = \sum_{x \in K_t} \delta_x$. Then $e_t = \phi(\chi_{[0,t]}) = \sum_{x \in K_t} p_x$ in M . Fix $n \in \mathbb{N}$, and set $J_i = K_{i/n} \setminus K_{(i-1)/n} \subseteq Y$. Note that $K_1 = X$, so that these J_i partition X into a disjoint union of n clopen sets. By construction,

$$\sum_{x \in J_i} p_x = \sum_{x \in K_{i/n}} p_x - \sum_{x \in K_{(i-1)/n}} p_x = e_{i/n} - e_{(i-1)/n}.$$

Now fix $x \in X$. Then $x \in J_i$ for some i , and $p_x \leq e_{i/n} - e_{(i-1)/n}$ as above. Thus

$$q_y p_x q_y \leq q_y (e_{i/n} - e_{(i-1)/n}) q_y = \frac{i}{n} q_y - \frac{i-1}{n} q_y = \frac{1}{n} q_y.$$

As n was arbitrary, we find that $q_y p_x q_y = 0$. Now $(p_x q_y)^*(p_x q_y) = q_y p_x q_y = 0$ gives $p_x q_y = 0$ for all $y \in Y$. Thus p_x is orthogonal to $\sum q_y = 1$ in M , whence $p_x = 0$ for all $x \in X$. It follows that $1 = \sum p_x = 0$ in M , and so $M = 0$. \square

Remark. We thank an anonymous referee for noticing that our arguments prevail without the full force of Kadison–Singer. This may be done as follows. Identifying the algebra $C(\mathbb{T})$ of continuous functions on the unit circle \mathbb{T} with the subalgebra $\{f \mid f(0) = f(1)\} \subseteq C[0, 1]$, it is known that $C(\mathbb{T})$ satisfies paving with respect to D . (Indeed, the algebra of Fourier polynomials—or more generally, the Wiener algebra $A(\mathbb{T})$ —is a dense subalgebra of $C(\mathbb{T})$ and lies in the algebra $M_0 \subseteq B(H)$ of operators that are l_1 -bounded in the sense of Tanbay [16] with respect to the Fourier basis $\{e_n \mid n \in \mathbb{Z}\}$. Thus $C(\mathbb{T})$ lies in the norm closure M of M_0 , and [16] shows that all operators in M can be paved with respect to D .) An argument as in Lemma 1 shows that the completely positive map ψ in the proof of the Theorem is uniquely determined on $C(\mathbb{T})$, and a computation as in Lemma 2 shows that this extension is the state corresponding to the arclength measure on \mathbb{T} . The Theorem may now be proved in essentially the same manner, replacing C with $C(\mathbb{T})$.

The proof of the Corollary uses stability of discretizations in the following sense.

Lemma 3. *If $\phi: B \rightarrow M$ is a discretization, $\alpha: A \rightarrow B$ is a morphism in **Cstar**, and $\beta: M \rightarrow N$ is a morphism in **AWstar**, then $\beta \circ \phi \circ \alpha$ discretizes A .*

Proof. If $C(X) \subseteq A$ is a commutative C^* -subalgebra, so is $C(Y) \cong \alpha[C(X)] \subseteq B$, making the top squares of the following diagram commute (where $\hat{\alpha}: Y \rightarrow X$ is the continuous function corresponding to α via Gelfand duality).

$$\begin{array}{ccccccc} A & \xrightarrow{\alpha} & B & \xrightarrow{\phi} & M & \overset{\beta}{\dashrightarrow} & N \\ \uparrow & & \uparrow & & \uparrow & & \\ C(X) & \xrightarrow{C(\hat{\alpha})} & C(Y) & \xrightarrow{\eta_{C(Y)}} & \ell^\infty(Y) & & \\ & \searrow \eta_{C(X)} & & \nearrow \ell^\infty(\hat{\alpha}) & & & \\ & & \ell^\infty(X) & & & & \end{array}$$

The bottom triangle commutes by naturality of η . As all dashed arrows are morphisms in **AWstar**, so is their composite. \square

Proof of Corollary. Let $\gamma: C(X) \hookrightarrow A$ be the embedding of a commutative C*-subalgebra. The hypotheses ensure that the following diagram commutes, where $F(\gamma)$ is a morphism in **AWstar**, making $\eta_A: A \rightarrow F(A)$ a discretization.

$$\begin{array}{ccc} A & \xrightarrow{\eta_A} & F(A) \\ \gamma \uparrow & & \uparrow F(\gamma) \\ C(X) & \hookrightarrow & \ell^\infty(X) \cong F(C(X)) \end{array}$$

Since K is infinite-dimensional, it is unitarily isomorphic to $H \otimes K$, so $a \mapsto a \otimes 1$ is a unital *-homomorphism $\iota: B(H) \rightarrow B(H) \otimes B(K) \cong B(K)$. Lemma 3 implies $\eta_A \circ \alpha \circ \iota: B(H) \rightarrow F(A)$ is a discretization, and the Theorem gives $F(A) = 0$. \square

REFERENCES

- [1] C. A. Akemann. The general Stone-Weierstrass problem. *J. Funct. Anal.*, 4:277–294, 1969.
- [2] B. van den Berg and C. Heunen. Noncommutativity as a colimit. *Applied Categorical Structures*, 20(4):393–414, 2012.
- [3] B. van den Berg and C. Heunen. Extending obstructions to noncommutative functorial spectra. *Theory and Applications of Categories*, 29:No. 17, 457–474, 2014.
- [4] R. Giles and H. Kummer. A non-commutative generalization of topology. *Indiana University Mathematics Journal*, 21(1):91–102, 1971.
- [5] J. Hamhalter. Isomorphisms of ordered structures of abelian C*-algebras. *Journal of Mathematical Analysis and Applications*, 383:391–399, 2011.
- [6] J. Hamhalter. Dye’s theorem and Gleason’s theorem for AW*-algebras. *Journal of Mathematical Analysis and Applications*, 422(2):1103–1115, 2015.
- [7] C. Heunen. The many classical faces of quantum structures. *arXiv:1412.2177, Handbook of Quantum Mechanics Interpretation*, 2015.
- [8] C. Heunen, N. P. Landsman, and B. Spitters. A topos for algebraic quantum theory. *Communications in Mathematical Physics*, 291:63–110, 2009.
- [9] C. Heunen and M. L. Reyes. Active lattices determine AW*-algebras. *Journal of Mathematical Analysis and Applications*, 416:289–313, 2014.
- [10] A. Kornell. V*-algebras. *arXiv:1502.01516*, 2015.
- [11] A. Marcus, D. A. Spielman, and N. Srivastava. Interlacing families II: mixed characteristic polynomials and the Kadison–Singer problem. *arXiv:1306.3969, Ann. Math.*, 2015.
- [12] V. I. Paulsen. *Completely bounded maps and operator algebras*, volume 78 of *Cambridge Studies in Advanced Mathematics*. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2002.
- [13] V. I. Paulsen and M. Raghupathi. Some new equivalences of Anderson’s paving conjectures. *Proceedings of the American Mathematical Society*, 136(12):4275–4282, 2008.
- [14] M. L. Reyes. Obstructing extensions of the functor Spec to noncommutative rings. *Israel Journal of Mathematics*, 192(2):667–698, 2012.
- [15] M. L. Reyes. Sheaves that fail to represent matrix rings. In *Ring theory and its applications*, volume 609 of *Contemp. Math.*, pages 285–297. American Mathematical Society, 2014.
- [16] B. Tanbay. Pure state extensions and compressibility of the l_1 -algebra. *Proceedings of the American Mathematical Society*, 113(3):707–713, 1991.

DEPARTMENT OF COMPUTER SCIENCE, UNIVERSITY OF OXFORD, OXFORD OX1 3QD, UK
E-mail address: `heunen@cs.ox.ac.uk`

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS, BOWDOIN COLLEGE, BRUNSWICK, ME 04011–8486, USA
E-mail address: `reyes@bowdoin.edu`